



Analysis of Character Education Management on Elementary School Students: Literature Review in Asia

Dewi Ningsih

State Vocational High School 4 Bandar Lampung, Indonesia

Abstract— This study aims to describe and analyze the management of character education in elementary school students in Asia. This study analyzes and elaborates the management of character education used in primary schools, especially in Asian countries. This descriptive content analysis research method was done by implementing a literature study. This literature review is to examine and analyze the management of character education for students used in primary school education in Asian countries in order to meet the standards of character education in elementary schools. This study found that character education management for elementary school students in Asian countries prioritizes habit or habits, which are continuously practiced and carried out. This research is limited to elementary schools, especially in Asian countries.

Keywords— Character Education Management, Elementary School.

I. INTRODUCTION

Globalization is an unavoidable reality that all people living in the world must face. In the modern era of media, information technology, and the tourism industry, globalization challenges the identity and character of the nation, especially for young people as the main consumers. Currently, the study of character education approaches has developed very rapidly. Character education aims to develop a person's ability to make good or bad decisions, maintain what is good, and manifest that goodness in everyday life with all his heart. Therefore, in the context of character education goals, there needs to be good and synergistic management between the various components of education involved, both formal, non-formal, and informal, both in schools, families, and communities (Harun, 2013: 302).

Character is human behavior related to God Almighty, oneself, fellow human beings, environment, and nationality which is manifested in thoughts, attitudes, feelings, words, and actions based on norms (Ngadiya, 2019). Character is a condition in a person that distinguishes himself from others. According to (Narwanti, 2011), character education is a system of inculcating character values to school members, including components of knowledge, awareness or willingness, and actions to implement these values; good to God Almighty, self, others, environment, and nationality.

Character development and character education are necessary because education not only makes students smart but also has a good character so that their existence as members of society becomes meaningful both for themselves and for others. In addition, character education is something old and new, in the sense of a discipline that takes root and develops (Berkowitz & Bier, 2007; 2014; Berkowitz & Hoppe, 2009).

Based on the results of research from Tannir and Al-Hroub (2013) on elementary school students in Kuwait, it shows that character building in schools is very important. It also requires that there needs to be professional development of teachers to train them to teach character education to students from different ability groups.

Management of character education through culture is an effort to educate students to have a good understanding so that they can behave applicable norms. The management of character education through culture is expected to produce people who can make decisions and are responsible for every decision taken (Agboola & Tsai, 2012).

Student character is related to moral actions related to individual fundamental beliefs and attitudes (Sarros & Cooper, 2006). The formation of student character can be directed through activities in the teaching and learning process (Marini, 2019). A study conducted by Milson & Mehlig (2002) found that teachers in primary schools were more effective in character education. The positive character of students can be encouraged by the application of character building in the teaching and learning process (Marini, 2019; Izfanna and Hisyam, 2012).

Character buildings programs can increase students' positive behavior (Thompson, 2002). The positive character development of students can be carried out in the teaching and learning process, school culture, extracurricular activities, and community involvement (Marini, 2019; Oktarina, Widiyanto, and Soekardi, 2015).

Character education applied in religious school culture can develop students' religious character (Marini, 2018). According to Gaol (2017) there are eight indicators of student character assessment, including: (1) not giving up, (2) being independent, (3) trying on their own, (4) giving opinions, (5) being responsible, (6) communication, (7) helping others, and (8) idealism.

Elementary school as one of the formal educational institutions organized by the government is an institution that has a strategic role in achieving these goals. As a primary level educational institution, an elementary school is a place where the foundation of character building of students can be institutionalized.

To support this goal, schools must also have effective and well-targeted socialization of the nation's character education model. Efforts to develop the practice of character building are important to overcome the moral and character crises that occur both at the individual and collective levels, which are reflected in educational institutions ranging from elementary schools to universities.

Therefore, to shape the culture and character of the nation, educational programs and processes cannot be separated from environmental factors, including community values, culture, and humanity.

This literature review tries to analyze how the management of character education is for elementary school students. Thus, the main research question for this study is "How is the management of character education in elementary school students in Asia?"

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

A. Character Education Management

Management is a social process that deals with the overall human effort with the help of other humans and other sources, using efficient and effective methods to achieve predetermined goals (Hamalik, 2010:16).

Educational management is defined as the overall process of joint activities in the field of education which includes planning, organizing, directing, reporting, coordinating, monitoring, and evaluating using available infrastructure, both personnel, material, and spiritual to achieve educational goals effectively and efficiently (Nata, 2008: 24).

Character is shaped by behavioral traits and informs all human interactions. Character is not only a mental state, but is formed from mental, moral, and spiritual components (Anshori, 2014: 89). Character education is the accumulation of knowledge and wisdom needed to create prosperity and harmony, thereby ensuring the smooth functioning of society (Rokhman et al., 2014: 1163).

This enables students to adopt certain traits and internalize certain values, which are reflected through their thoughts, emotions, and behavior (Rawana et al., 2011: 140). The Child Development Project (CDP) is another character program that has been adopted by several American schools (Watson, 2006). It promotes students' social, emotional, ethical, and intellectual development of students. Program effects were examined at the elementary level and demonstrated a long-term positive effect on student self-esteem.

According to Alexander (2001: 67), character education teaches students values such as accountability, responsibility, discipline, patience, and perseverance. The family is the front line in character education, so it becomes an effective means of conveying values and beliefs (Hyoscyamina, 2011; Purwaningsih, 2010; Suarmini et al., 2016; Subianto, 2013).

Likewise, schools not only function to transfer knowledge to students, but also to shape the attitudes, behaviors, characters, and abilities of future generations (Rokhman, 2014:1161). Social and religious institutions are equally important in character education (Haningsih, 2008; Nurmalisa & Adha, 2003).

According to Lickona (1996), character education is a powerful medium to motivate democratic life, which is a reflection of the human character that grows within each individual in the context of collective life. Linda (1995) explains that these values are "existence values" and "giving values". The values of being are values that are embedded in ourselves that develop into the actions and ways we treat others, for example: honest, kind, peaceful, reliable, disciplined, and within limits.

The value of giving is the value that needs to be practiced or given; taking into account that what will be received is the same as what will be given, for example, loyalty, trust, respect, love, compassion, sensitivity, selflessness, benevolence, friendliness, justice, and generosity. Based on the explanation above, it can be concluded that the management of character education is an overall effort, using effective methods to form good behavior by teaching values and norms of life from an early age.

B. Elementary School Students

Children at the age of around 7-13 years are the period of the second fastest growth after toddlers. Children are more active in choosing the preferred food or are called active consumers. Energy needs are greater because they do more physical activities, such as sports, playing, or helping their parents (Istiany and Rusilanti, 2013). The elementary school ages period is divided into low grades (grades 1, 2, and 3) and high grades students (grades 4, 5, and 6). wider (Sudarmawan, 2013).

When children enter school, they begin to gain the ability to relate a series of events to describe mental expressions that can be expressed verbally or symbolically. This stage is termed the concrete operational stage according to Piaget. At this stage, children can use thought processes to experience events and actions (Harlimsyah, 2007).

In addition, children's knowledge will increase rapidly with age, the skills mastered are increasingly diverse. Children's interest in this period is mainly focused on everything that is dynamically moving. The implication is that children tend to carry out various activities that will be useful in the process of their future development (Jatmika, 2005).

III. RESEARCH METHODS

The method used in this research is a descriptive content analysis study, which is an analysis that aims to describe the main content based on the collection of information obtained (Herliandry, Nurhasanah, Suban, & Kuswanto, 2020). The information in question comes from various scientific articles related to the management of character education on elementary school students.

The scientific papers are obtained from several sources, such as national journals and international journals. The data and information obtained are then collected and analyzed and concluded so as to get a recommendation as a literature study.

This literature review focuses on the relationship between the management of character education, especially in elementary school students. Thus, this literature review is built by gathering and filtering literature under the following conditions and search keys:

- a. Management of character education: 361.000 results
- b. Character education: 1.230.000 results
- c. Character: 1.690.000 results
- d. Elementary school students: 607.000 results
- e. Range of research year between 2015-2022

Thus, there are 15 articles analyzed in this paper. This article is mainly about character education management and how character education management affects output and how effective character education is for developing human resources from an early age. Most importantly, the subjects especially teachers or students around Asian countries are the subject of this paper. The reviews are written below:

Table 1: Character Education Management on Elementary School Students

Author and Year	Title	Country	Method	Sample	Result
Masnia, Fitriyani, and Ji Bing (2018)	Conceptual Analysis of Character Education with Integrated Quality Insight in Indonesia	Indonesia	Descriptive Qualitative	20 Articles about character education	The nature of character education for Indonesia Character education is education that balances science (science and technology) and the religion knowledge, so that people have the awareness to do the best or excellence, and able to act according to their potential and awareness.
Pattaro, C. (2016)	Character Education: Themes and Research. An Academic Literature Review	Italy	Literature Review	145 peer-reviewed academic journals about character education	Character education approaches when implemented rigorously and with a scientific foundation can facilitate an effective learning process, can have a positive effect both on prosocial values and academic achievement and can reduce at risk behavior.
Fathinnaufal and Hidayati (2020)	The Implementation of Character Education in Elementary School	Indonesia	Qualitative	The principals of elementary school 006 Sangkulirang	Implementation of character education in Public Elementary School 006 has been going well, such as the civilization process students pray before starting learning activities, taking pickets alternately with classmates, reviving greetings culture greet and smile, conduct Dhuhur prayer at school, commemorate national and religious holidays and this is also supported by extracurricular activitie.



Marsakha, Hariri, and Sowiyah (2021)	Management of Character Educaion in School: A Literature Riview	Indonesia	Literature Review	22 articles about the management of character education	The character education management in school is one way to anticipate and minimize the nation's moral decline which is a problem in the world of education.
Fitri, Akbar, and Madhakomala (2018)	Character Educational Management (A Case Study in The Elementary School Penyengat Island)	Indonesia	Qualitative	Students and teachers at the elementary school Penyengat Island	In the management of the implementation of character education in Penyengat Island has been running well seen from the aspects of curriculum implementation, educators, infrastructure facilities, and student affairs.
Chowdhury (2016)	Emphasizing Morals, Values, Ethics, and Character Education in Science Education and Science Teaching	Malaysia	Qualitative	University Islamic in Malaysia	Students can develop higher awareness of social implications of their science studies, become self-dependent individuals, and be able to recognize, accept and internalize their roles indecision making
Sukardi, I. (2016)	Character Education Based on Religous Value: an Islamic Perpective	Indonesia	Qualitative	Islamic school in Indonesia	Islam as religious affiliation of the population in Indonesia has actually provide a source of very rich character education concept.
Muttaqin, Raharjo, and Masturi (2018)	The Implementation Main Values of Character Education Reinforcement in Elementary School	Indonesia	Descriptive Qualitative	The elementary schools located in Semarang, Indonesia	The Character Education Reinforcement offers the character education as the core in the implementation of education within the elementary school.
Heriyanto, Satori, Komariah, and Suryana (2019)	Character Education in The Era of Industrial Revolution 4.0	Indonesia	Qualitative	30 students and 20 parents in a Bandung	Character education is still needed and relevant, the implementation of character education



	and Its Relevance to The High School Learning Transformation Process			Christian High School.	in the IR 4.0 era must not only be conceptual, but it must also be holistic, involving all parties, actual, supported by facilities and infrastructure, and designed with measurable standards.
Muassomah, Abdullah, Istiadah, Mujahidin, Masnawi and Sahrah (2020)	Believe in Literature: Character Education for Indonesia's Youth	Indonesia	Qualitative	32 students and 20 teachers at a senior high school in Malang, Indonesia	Through the application of literature as a medium for and approach to character education, students' cognitive, affective, and psychomotor intelligences were improved
Benninga, Berkowitz, Kuehn, and Smith (2003)	The Relationship of Character Education Implementation and Academic Achievement in Elementary Schools	California	Quantitative	681 elementary schools applying for the California Distinguished Schools Award in 2000	Quality character education is good academic education is bolstered by findings that educational interventions with character-related themes produce a range of effects that are linked to effective schooling
Tannir and Al-Hround (2015)	Effects of Character Education on The Self-Esteem of Intellectually Able and Less Able Elementary Students in Kuwait	Kuwait	Quantitative	39 students of elementary school in Kuwait	The character education program had benefited the intellectually able more than the intellectually less able students.
Milson and Mehlig (2015)	Elementary School Teachers' Sense of Efficacy for Character Education	United Kingdom	Quantitative	254 elementary school teachers in a large midwestern suburban school district	Elementary school teachers feel efficacious about most aspects of character education



Rawana, Franks, Brownlee, Rawana, and Neckoway (2015)	The Application of A Strength-Based Approach of Students' Behaviours to The Development of A Character Education Curriculum For Elementary and Secondary Schools	Canada	Qualitative	Elementary and Secondary Schools In Canada	Achieve the goals of charact by developing a curriculum of character education that is based upon students' strengths in multiple domains of functioning
Suherman (2017)	The Implementation of Character Education Values in Integrated Physical Education Subject in Elementary School	Indonesia	Research and Development (R&D)	34 students of state elementary school Panyingkiran III in Sumedang Regency.	Character values can be implemented in physical education in elementary schools in Sumedang Regency.

IV. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This section reports the results and discussion of the articles reviewed. The analysis shows that most of the articles focus on how the management of character education is built in elementary schools so that it can affect the quality of children's behavior in social life. It can be seen from the articles reviewed that educational management is the mobilization of all educational resources to achieve predetermined educational goals. Educational management is divided into four management functions, namely planning, organizing, actuating, and controlling (POAC) (Terry, 1978).

Taking the example of the curriculum planning implemented at the Panyingkiran III public elementary school in Sumedang Regency, the planning stage of designing the implementation of integrated character values in all subjects in elementary schools consists of the following syntax. First, analyzing student needs based on the implementation of character values. Second, add activities that are loaded with character values in several integrated learning activities. Third, evaluate character-based learning which will be added or reduced according to student needs (Suherman, 2018).

The strategies of the implementation of character education at school have to take an integrated path. First, integrating character education content formulated into all subjects. Second, integrating character education into daily school activities. Third, integrating the character education into structured or planned activities. Fourth, building communication and cooperation between schools and parents (Lickona, 1996). Organizing is carried out in the application of character education in elementary schools with the aim of

dividing a large activity into more specific activities. Organizing makes it easier for managers to monitor and determine the people needed to carry out the tasks that have been divided. This is relevant to the statement of Panoyo et al (2019); Laksana (2016) that organizing is done by distributing tasks to all school members in strengthening character education so that it is easier to supervise the implementation of the tasks that have been given.

The movement in character education management begins with teacher training programs that can demonstrate that teachers can address issues related to morals, values and ethics, and articulate different pedagogical approaches to address them. Teacher training may be aimed at dealing effectively when students' morals, values and ethics clash with other students and Western teachers and science.

Teachers should be careful when debatable discussions develop in classrooms where many students may have different morals, values, and ethics on this sensitive issue. A sensitive teacher who acts as a good facilitator can handle situations of differences in moral, value and ethical differences among students; and will seek to prevent students from adopting certain morals, values and ethics (Chowdhury, 20616).

Lastly, the control or supervision in the management of character education in the activities of culture and habituation are directly carried out by all school components, especially teachers and education staff. The teacher in charge of cultivation and habituation activities plays a very strategic role, especially in supervising the course of activities so that they are as planned (Ngadiya, 2019).

The broad conclusion from this review is that the character education of students carried out by schools, both in the classroom through the learning process and in the school environment through habituation and coaching, is always carried out with improvement and reflection efforts.

So that the character education that is instilled in elementary school students can be applied in social life from an early age. Like other studies, this review has limitations such as its focus on the Asian region; discussed a lot of studies in Indonesia, especially the management of character education.

V. CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the review and discussion, it can be concluded that character education is the education of values, character, morals, and character, which aims to develop students' abilities in making good and bad decisions, maintaining what is good, and realizing that goodness in everyday life by wholeheartedly.

Character education management must involve all parties by applying management principles, namely, planning, organizing, actuating, and controlling.

In addition, instilling character education must also involve aspects of good knowledge, having good moral feelings, and good behavior. Thus, character education is closely related to habitat or habits, which are continuously practiced and carried out.

REFERENCES

- [1] Agboola, A., & Tsai, K. C. "Bring Character Education Into Classroom". *European Journal of Education Research*, 1(2), 2012, pp. 163-170.
- [2] Alexander, C. M. "Character development: A value-added concept". *Seminars in Orthodontics*, 7(2), 2001, pp. 67-73. doi: 10.1053/sodo.2001.23539
- [3] Anshori, S. "The Contribution of Social Science In Character Education". *Jurnal Edueksos*, 3(2), 2014.
- [4] Benninga, Jacques S., Berkowitz, Marvin W., Kuehn, Phyllis., & Smith, Karen. "The Relationship of Character Education Implementation and Academic Achievement in Elementary Schools". *Journal of Research in Character Education*, vol. 1(1), 2015.
- [5] Berkowitz, M. W. & Bier, M. C. Research-Based Fundamentals of The Effective Promotion of Character Development in Schools. In L. Nucci, D. Narvaez & T. Krettenauer (Eds), *Handbook of moral and character education*. New York: Routledge, 2015, pp. 248-260
- [6] Berkowitz, M. W. & Hoppe, M. A. "Character Education and Gifted Children". *High Ability Studies*, 20 (2), 2009, pp. 131-142.
- [7] Chowhury, Mohammad. "Emphasizing Morals, Values, Ethics, and Character Education in Science Education and Science Teaching". *The Malaysian Online Journal of Educational Science*, vol. 4(2), 2016.
- [8] Fathinnaufal, M., & Hidayati, D. The Implementation of Character Education In Elementary School. *Journal of Educational Management and Leadership*, 1(2), 2020, pp. 31-38. doi:10.33369/jeml.1.2.31-38
- [9] Fitri, Raja Suzana., Akbar, Makruf., & Madhakomala, R. "Character Educational Management (A Case Study in The Elementary School Penyengat Island)". *Indonesian Journal of Educational Review*, vol.5 (1), 2335-8407, 2018.
- [10] Gaol, P. L., Khumaedi, M., & Masrukan, M. "Development of Confidence Character Assessment Instruments in Junior High School Mathematics Subjects". *Journal of Educational Research and Evaluation*, 6(1), 2017, pp. 63-70. <https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/jere/article/view/16209>
- [11] Hamalik, O. *Curriculum Development Management*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2010.
- [12] Haningsih, S. "The Strategic Role of Pesantren, Madrasa and Islamic Schools in Indonesia". *El Tarbawi*, 1(1), 2000, pp. 27-39. Retrieved from <http://www.jurnal.uui.ac.id/index.php/Tarbawi/article/view/186>
- [13] Harlimsyah. *Aspects of Growth and Development*. Jakarta: EGC, 2007.
- [14] Harun, Zahri. *Character Education Management*. *Jurnal. Universitas Syiah Kuala*. Tahun III. Nomor 3. Oktober, 2013.

- [15] Heriyanto, Satori, D., Komariah, A., & Suryana, A. "Character Education in The Era of Industrial Revolution 4.0 and Its Relevance to The High School Learning Transformation Process". *Utopia Y Praxis Latinoamericana*, vol. 24(5), 2019.
- [16] Hyoscyamina, D. E. The Role of The Family in Building Children's Character. *Jurnal Psikologi Undip*, 10(2), 2012. pp. 144-152.
- [17] Istiany, Ari and Rusilanti. *Applied Nutrition*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 2013.
- [18] Izfanna, D. & Hisyam, M. A. "A Comprehensive Approach in Developing Akhlaq. *Multicultural Education & Technology Journal*, Vol. 6 No. 2, 2012, pp. 77-86
- [19] Jatmika, H. "Utilization of Visual Media in Supporting Physical Education Learning in Elementary Schools". *Indonesian Journal of Physical Education*, 2005.
- [20] Koesoema, A. Dony. *Strategies to Educate Children in the Global Age*. Jakarta: Grasindo, 2007.
- [21] Lickona, Tom. *Eleven Principles of Effective Character Education*. *Journal of moral Education*. 25:93-100. (1996).
- [22] Linda. N. Eyre. *Teaching Your Children Values*. New York: Simon and Chuster. (1995).
- [23] Marini, A. "Managing School Based on Character Building in The Context of Religious School Culture (Case In Indonesia)". *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 274-294, Vol. 9 No. 4, 2018.
- [24] Marini, A. "Model of Character Building For Elementary School Students". *International Journal of Control and Automation*, 01-10, Vol. 12 No. 4(10), 2010.
- [25] Marini, A. "School Management on The Basis of Character Building in Teaching Learning Process". *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Vol. 1402 No. 2, 2019, pp. 1-6.
- [26] Marshaka, Anisa Tasya., Hariri, Hasan., & Sowiyah. "Management of Character Educaion in School: A Literature Riview". *Manage Educational Management Journal*, Vol. 8, (2), 2549-9661, 2021.
- [27] Masnia., Fitriyanti, Pipit., & Bing, Liang Ji. *Conceptual Analysis of Character Education with Integrated Quality Insight in Indonesia*. *International Colloquium: Opportunities and Challenges on Education Management in 21st Century*. Hatyai University, Hatyai, Thailand, 2018.
- [28] Milson, A. J. & Mehlig, L. M. "Elementary School Teachers' Sense of Efficacy for Character Education. *The Journal of Educational Research*, Vol. 96 No. 1. 2015, pp. 47-53, 10.1080/00220670209598790
- [29] Muassomah. Abdullah, Irwan., Istiadah., Mujahidin, Anwar., Masnawi, Nurnaningsih, & Sohrah. "Believe in Literature: Character Education for Indonesia's Youth". *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, vol. 8(6), 2223-2231, 2020.
- [30] Muslich, Masnur. *Character Education: Responding to the Challenges of a Multidimensional Crisis*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2011.
- [31] Muttaqin, Muhamad Fauzan., Raharjo, Tri Joko., & Masturi. "The Implementation Main Values of Character Education Reinforcement in Elementary School". *Journal of Primary Education*, vol. 7(1), 2018.

- [32] Narwanti, S. Character Education: Integrating 18 Character-Shaping Values in Subjects. Yogyakarta: Familia, 2011.
- [33] Nata, A. Education Management Overcoming Education Weaknesses in Indonesia. Jakarta: Kencana, 2008.
- [34] Ngadiya. "Evaluation of Character Education Management for SMAN 2 Banguntapan Students". Jurnal Ideguru, vol. 4(1), 2019.
- [35] Nurmalisa, Y. & Adha, M.M. "The Role of Social Institutions in The Development of Adolescents Moral in High School". Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan, 1(1), 1-6, 2003.
- [36] Oktarina, N., Widiyanto, & Soekardi. Character Education Evaluation Model Based on School Culture For Elementary School. IOSR Journal of Research & Method in Education, Vol. 5 No. 5, 2015, pp. 11-14.
- [37] Pattaro, C. "Character Education: Themes and Researches. An academic Literature Review". Italian Journal of Sociology of Education, 8(1), 2016, pp. 6-30. doi: 10.14658/pupj-ijse-2016-1-2
- [38] Purwaningsih, E. "Families in Realizing Value Education As An Effort To Overcome The Degradation of Moral Values". Jurnal Pendidikan Sosiologi dan Humaniora, 1(1), 2010, pp. 43-55
- [39] Rawana, J., Franks, J., Brownlee, K., Rawana, E. & Neckoway, R. "The Application of A Strength-Based Approach of Students' Behaviours To The Development of A Character Education Curriculum For Elementary and Secondary School". The Journal of Educational Thought (JET)/ Revue De La Pensée Éducative, 45(2), 2015, pp. 127-144. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/23767076>.
- [40] Rokhman, F., Hum, M., Syaifudin, A. & Yuliati. "Character education for golden generation 2045 National Character Building for Indonesian Golden Years". Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 141, 1161-1165, 2014, doi: 10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.05.197
- [41] Sarros, J. C. & Cooper, B. K. "Building Character: A Leadership Essential". Journal of Business and Psychology, Vol. 21 No. 1, 2006, pp. 1-22.
- [42] Suarmini, N.W., Rai, N.G.M. & Marsudi, M. "The Character of Children in The Family As A Social and Cultural Resilience of The Nation". Jurnal Sosial Humaniora, 2016, 9(1), 78. doi: 10.12962/j24433527.v9i1.1280
- [43] Subianto, J. "The Role of Families, Schools, and Communities in The Formation of Quality Characters". Edukasia: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Islam, 8(2), 2016, pp. 331-354.
- [44] Sudarmawan. The Relationship Between Knowledge and Attitude Regarding Snack Selection With Children's Behavior in Choosing Snacks At SDN Sambikerep II/480 Surabaya, Faculty of Sports Science, State University of Surabaya, 2013.
- [45] Suherman, Ayi. The Implementation of Character Education Values in Integrated Physical Education Subject in Elementary School. SHS Web of Conferences 42, 00045, 2017.



- [46] Sukardi, Ismail. "Character Education Based on Religious Value: an Islamic Perspective". Ta'dib: Journal of Islamic Education, vol. 21(1), 2016.
- [47] Tannir, Abir and Al-Hroub, Anies. "Effects of Character Education on The Self-Esteem of Intellectually Able and Less Able Elementary Students in Kuwait". International Journal of Special Education, vol. 28(1), 2015.
- [48] Thompson, W. G. The Effects of Character Education on Student Behavior. Electronic eses and Dissertations. Paper 706, 2002.
- [49] Watson, M. "Long-Term Effects of Moral/Character Education in Elementary School in Pursuit of Mechanisms. Journal of Research in Character Education, 4, 2015, pp. 1-18.
- [50] Zainal, Aqib. Building Positive Behavior of the Nation's Children.. Bandung: Yrama Widya, 2011.

